

In *Frontiers of Education in China*, Vol. 7, No. 3, pp. 338-346.

A Bridge too Far? Comparative Reflections on St Paul and Confucius

By Ruth Hayhoe

This is a very special moment in my life and I am deeply grateful to all of you who have come to Toronto to celebrate with me. In the memoir I published in 2004,¹ I explained the reasons for my hesitation over dealing explicitly with matters of faith in my scholarly work. Now I will throw aside that hesitation and share with you some reflections on the importance of the spiritual dimension in my journey of scholarship.

In short, I will develop some comparative reflections on two individuals who laid the foundations for the faith traditions that have most influenced my life: St Paul and Confucius.² While they lived in different times and different contexts, each made a lasting contribution to educational thought and practice in the European and Chinese worlds respectively. St. Paul carried the message of Shalom, peace with justice, from Judea through Asia Minor, on to the Greek cities of Corinth and Athens, then finally to Rome itself, at a time when Pax Romana, a peace based on military subjugation, was beginning to falter.³ Five centuries earlier, Confucius carried a message of love with justice in his extensive travels among the surviving kingdoms of the late Zhou dynasty, shortly before the period known as the Warring States in Chinese history. Both lived an intense devotion to the mission they were called to fulfil, nurtured disciples and followers and faced the end of their lives in circumstances where there was no clear evidence that their mission had been achieved. That was left to the disciples and followers they had mentored, and the stories, letters and texts they left behind.

¹ Ruth Hayhoe, *Full Circle: A Life with Hong Kong and China* (Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, University of Hong Kong, 2004).

² Confucius, the Latinized form of Kong Fuzi, the Master Kong, incorporates the respect that is accorded to Paul in addressing him as St. Paul.

³ John Dominic Crossan and Jonathan L Reed, *In Search of Paul: How Jesus's Apostle Opposed Rome's Empire with God's Kingdom*, (New York: Harper Collins, 2004).

Given that the honorary fellow is a recognition of a life-long contribution in the areas of teaching, mentoring, scholarship and service to the Comparative and International Education Society and the wider educational world, it obviously comes at a stage of life when one is facing retirement. This is a time when energy for new ventures and projects is waning. It thus becomes important to think carefully about how best to garner one's time for what is most important, and to reflect on how to pass on the insights, experiences and precious opportunities of a lifetime. I have begun to think about this as a transition from a productive to a more contemplative and connective mode of life. I have also felt it was important, while still active and healthy, to reflect in depth on the reality we all face of the end of life.

In these reflections, I would thus like to turn to the lives and convictions of St Paul and Confucius, asking how these two great teachers viewed the later stages of their lives, how they prepared for the inevitable passing into the next life, how they mentored their followers, and what core elements of faith and value they upheld for us. As all good comparativists know, it is important to begin with context, and so I will try to sketch out a picture of the life and times of Paul in the first century CE, and then go back five hundred years earlier to Confucius and his life in China's late Zhou dynasty. After setting these two great teachers in context, I will then identify a few texts which express the ways in which they defined the later part of their lives, and the sense that they had about the meaning of those lives. Finally, I will turn to the core messages that we have been privileged to receive from their teachings, and identify some values in common, that have supported my efforts to bridge the educational worlds of China and the West. I wish also to pay tribute to the mentors who have blessed and inspired me every step along the way, mentors from both the traditions of the West and East Asia.

The Context

Given that Christianity is the faith tradition in which I was raised, I will begin with St Paul. Born in the city of Tarsus in Asia Minor, he came to Jerusalem as a young man, determined to further his education in the School of Gamaliel, and was drawn into some of the intense debates going on between members of the Temple, the Pharisaic schools and the disciples of Jesus, including Peter and James. His dramatic conversion on

the road to Damascus and his subsequent period of reflection in the Arabian desert set the direction for a life in which he moved in ever widening geographical circles, taking the Christian gospel to Antioch, to various parts of Asia Minor, to Macedonia and Greece and finally to Rome itself. He probably did not make Spain, but it was on his agenda!⁴

The phases of his career were marked by controversy – disagreements with James and Peter over the question of who the message was intended for and how far the widening constituency he reached should adhere to Jewish law alongside of salvation by grace alone, major breakups with such companions on his journeys as Barnabas and Silas, periods of imprisonment in Ephesus, Caesarea and Rome. In his later days, his rich correspondence with members of the congregations he founded in Philippi, Corinth, and Ephesus indicates close and deep attachments, and there is evidence that several followers stayed close by up to the time of his death in Nero's Rome in 64 CE. Prime among these was Timothy, whom he described as his loyal child in the faith, and who stayed with him to the end of his life and carried forward his mission.⁵

Never married, Paul has often been viewed as a woman-hater, due to the strictures against women's leadership in the church and instructions on obedience found in some of his letters. Recent scholarship suggests, however, that the letters in which these passages are found may have been later texts, written under Paul's name, with the intention of ensuring the Christian community was seen to conform with Roman custom.⁶ The prominence of such women leaders as Priscilla, Phoebe, Lydia, Claudia and others in Paul's missionary efforts suggest how fully Paul acted out his belief that "in Christ there is no longer Jew or Greek, there is no longer slave or free, there is no longer male or female; for all of you are one in Christ Jesus."⁷

While Paul emphasized the gift of grace and the futility of Greek wisdom, there can be no doubt about his understanding of Stoic philosophy and the richness of educational thought and argumentation expressed in such unquestionably authentic letters as Romans and 1st Corinthians. These give evidence of the universality of his vision: "for

⁴ Bruce Chilton, *Rabbi Paul: An Intellectual Biography* (New York: Image Books, Doubleday, 2004).

⁵ *Ibid.* Chilton provides a compelling account of his life, travels and relationships.

⁶ Crossan and Reed, *In Search of Paul*, pp. 110-116.

⁷ *Galatians* 3:28 (The New Oxford Annotated Bible, 3rd edition, 2001)

the creation waits with eager longing for the revealing of the children of God.”⁸ Crossan and Reed give a compelling picture of the Roman empire in the time of Paul, rapidly dissolving into disorder under successive emperors, yet seeking to impose the moral codes of Augustus wherever military victory buttressed their authority. A peace imposed from above by force is thus contrasted with the Shalom peace - or peace with justice - that was central to Paul’s vision of Christianity as a world religion, they suggest.⁹

From this brief depiction of the life of St Paul, I now turn to the life of Confucius, five centuries earlier in China’s Central Plain. It was a time when the Chinese Empire already had major achievements in terms of law codes, the development of bronze technologies, and a rich literature in its own unique writing system. A number of states were contending strongly with each other for hegemony over the central plain as the Eastern Zhou dynasty gradually unraveled. Confucius grew up in the state of Lu. Forced out of his paternal home at a very young age, he was brought up in poverty. Conditions in Lu, however, enabled him to pursue an insatiable quest for knowledge through reading ancient texts, also to deal with the tragic loss of his mother at the age of 17. Although he married and had a son and daughter, little is known about his wife and he lived out his teaching and traveling mission alone. He had many disciples and a few faithful followers, who accompanied him on his travels.¹⁰

Confucius’s brief autobiography, found in the *Analects*, indicates that at 15 he set his heart on learning, at 30 he took his stance and at 40 was no longer of two minds. Unlike Paul, there was no visitation of the Divine, simply a deepening awareness of something he was to call “the mandate or bidding of Heaven.” This was a call to reform society and bring about justice and love through education, which he felt he had come to know at 50.¹¹

In 521 BCE, when he was just 30, Confucius had started a school and begun to nurture disciples. His highest goal was to attract rulers into his school, such that the

⁸ *Romans* 8:19.

⁹ Crossan and Reed, *In Search of Paul*, pp. 135-177.

¹⁰ *Confucius: Words of Wisdom*, A & E Biography. This excellent DVD depicts the life of Confucius in a clear and compelling way, with input from Julia Ching, Tu Weiming, Roger Ames and other well known scholars of classical China.

¹¹ *Analects* 2:4. See Roger T Ames and Henry Rosemont, *The Analects of Confucius: A Philosophical Translation* (A New Translation Based on the Dingzhou Fragments and Other Recent Archaeological Finds) (New York: Ballantine Books, 1998), p. 76.

precepts of love and justice and the idea of a society based on ritual could be realized in action for the social good. Finally, the opportunity came, when Duke Ting of Lu employed him as advisor, from 501 to 497 BC, and he put in place such social programs as support for the poor and elderly from state granaries. However, after a brief four years serving under Duke Ting he was forced into exile by enemies opposed to his teaching and influence.

For fourteen years he traveled among the warring kingdoms, sometimes staying two or three years in one place, and often finding himself in difficult and even desperate circumstances. There were times when he and his few loyal followers were surrounded by an enemy and denied access to shelter and food, coming close to starvation more than once.¹² Nor was he able to find any single ruler among the various kingdoms who was inclined to listen seriously to his teaching and put it into practice.

It is a fascinating exercise to compare Confucius' calling as an educator and missionary for moral and social transformation with that of St Paul. He believed that "Heaven does not speak,"¹³ yet he was prepared to travel widely for fourteen years, seeking to take a message that he knew to be transformative to any kingdom that would accept him. His message was a universal one, focused around two qualities that he saw as essential for human flourishing. Trust (信) is a character that indicates how the words proceeding from one's mouth must be true – a tacit rule that is essential to the maintenance of social order. Benevolence (仁) suggests that "whenever two human beings come face to face there comes into being a code of ethics which those two must mutually observe." This idea of goodness is also explained as "putting oneself in the other's position and thinking about things."¹⁴

After his fourteen years of exhausting and apparently fruitless travel, Confucius returned to his home state of Lu at the age of 68, and lived out his remaining four or five years as a teacher and advisor, without being able to have a measurable influence over any ruler. His favorite disciple, Yan Hui, died at 41, and his son had died a year earlier. When he himself died at the age of 73, the last words on his lips were "Will no ruler

¹² Qu Chunli, *The Life of Confucius* (Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1996), pp. 414-419.

¹³ *Analects* 17:19.

¹⁴ Yasushi Inoue, *Confucius: An Historical Novel by a major Japanese writer* (London: Peter Owen, 1989), p. 49.

come forward and take me as his advisor?”¹⁵ Apparently his efforts had been in vain, except for the disciples who outlived him and carried forward his teachings. While St Paul was known to have written a number of the letters accredited to him, with others possibly coming from the pen of later followers, Confucius left no written texts. His teachings were collected into ten little books by various disciples over the first century after his death, and another hundred years later compiled into the *Analects*,¹⁶ a book that was to be recited by heart among generations of learners in East Asia thereafter.

Like St. Paul, Confucius has often been depicted as a woman-hater, and unlike Paul there is no clear record of women who collaborated closely with his educational mission. However, considerable research done in recent years indicates that many Chinese women were able to create meaningful lives for themselves within a Confucian world order, also that the holism and integration of Confucian epistemology is fundamentally compatible with the “women’s ways of knowing” that have been identified in feminist scholarship.¹⁷

Facing the End of Life

In the brief sketches given above of St Paul and Confucius, we can see that both of them came to the end of their lives and careers in a situation of apparent failure and loss – it was not given to either of them to know the enormous influence their ideas were to have over long historical periods and wide geographical regions. Given this situation, it is interesting to reflect on how they viewed their lives, when reaching the final phase and what they communicated to their followers.

If we begin with St Paul, the obvious choice of quotation is found in the *Second Letter to Timothy*. Although there is some doubt whether this is an original Pauline composition or a later letter written in Paul’s name to establish patterns of order and governance in the church, the images ring true to the Paul we know in letters such as *Philippians*, where authorship is not in doubt: “As for me, I am already being poured out as a libation, and the time of my departure has come. I have fought the good fight, I have

¹⁵ *Confucius: Words of Wisdom*.

¹⁶ Ames and Rosemont, *The Analects of Confucius*, pp. 7-10.

¹⁷ Ruth Hayhoe, *Portraits of Influential Chinese Educators* (Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, University of Hong Kong and Springer, 2006), pp. 37-38.

finished the race, I have kept the faith. From now on there is reserved for me the crown of righteousness.....”¹⁸

The images in this passage are powerful ones, that reflect the times in which Paul lived – the importance of athletics and the games in Greek culture, the ubiquity of Roman altars on which libations were poured, and a sense of constant struggle and combat. In his letter to the *Philippians*, Paul had written of the passionate goal he had embraced, of “knowing Christ in the power of his resurrection and the sharing of his suffering” and bringing that knowledge to all whom he could reach. “Not that I have already obtained this or have already reached the goal, but I press on to make it my own.....”¹⁹ Here is certainly the image of a race that gives focus to intense effort. Also in *Philippians*, Paul used the image of a libation to express his intense concern for those he wished to serve: “even if I am being poured out as a libation over the sacrifice and offering of your faith, I am glad and rejoice with all of you.....”²⁰ Finally, the military image of a good fight well fought can be found in the letter to the *Ephesians*, where he urges his followers to “put on the whole armor of God,” including the belt of truth, the breastplate of righteousness, the shield of faith, and “shoes that will make you ready to proclaim the gospel of peace.”²¹

The images used to convey his sense of completion and fulfillment in this letter to Timothy thus have a ring of authenticity, even if the text may have been written at a later time. It is interesting also to note that Paul was not depicted as being on his deathbed at this point; rather he was asking Timothy to come to visit him as soon as possible, wanting to get a cloak that had been left in Troas, books that he needed for his work, and most especially some important parchments. Furthermore, he was surrounded by friends and collaborators, some of whom are mentioned by name.²²

The scene we may imagine as a backdrop to this letter would probably be during his final two years under house arrest in Rome, before the brutal death he is thought to have faced at the hands of Nero after Rome’s burning in 64 CE. He was about 56 or 57 years old, had traveled extensively, carrying his message and establishing churches in

¹⁸ 2 Timothy 4:6-8.

¹⁹ *Philippians* 3:10-12

²⁰ *Philippians* 2:17

²¹ *Ephesians* 6:13-17

²² 2 Timothy 4: 11-13, 21.

places of such strategic importance as Ephesus, Athens and Corinth. There had been many disagreements, he had suffered imprisonment and various kinds of punishment, he had alienated many who took different positions on this new faith, and now the time had come to pass on the mantle.

If the quote from *Second Timothy* gives genuine insight into the mind of Paul, he had a sense of fulfillment, completion and anticipation. It was not a matter of being proud or arrogant, however. In his first letter to the *Corinthians*, he spoke of himself as being “the least of the apostles, unfit to be called an apostle because I persecuted the Church of God.”²³ In another passage he called himself “the very least of all saints.”²⁴ The sense of completion came from his awareness of grace and of all that he had done being a matter of “God’s Son being revealed or uncovered within him”²⁵ – an inner experience of the Divine Presence. This gave him a deep sense that the work that had begun in him would be continued in others – far beyond what he could see or imagine from the conditions of house arrest in a viciously anti-Christian Rome.

What about Confucius, how did he deal with the final phase of his life, and the sense of a mission that could not be completed? I have noted earlier his short autobiography, which is included in *The Analects*. It suggests the trajectory of a life that unfolded in a series of steps, from “taking his stance” as an educator at thirty and being “no longer of two minds” at forty, to understanding the mandate of Heaven” at age fifty and having “his ears attuned” at age sixty. “At seventy,” stated Confucius, “I could give my heart-and-mind free reign without overstepping the mark.”²⁶ There is a serenity in this self-depiction that belies the description of his road to wisdom as “a bitter trail of tears,”²⁷ and the reality of his life experience. There had been only four years in which he was able to serve as a political advisor in his home state of Lu, and this had been followed by fourteen years of apparently fruitless wandering.

Japanese novelist Yasushi Inoue, in his historical novel about Confucius, uses the device of a forgotten disciple, recalling after forty years his memories of life with the

²³ *1 Corinthians* 15:8

²⁴ *Ephesians* 3:8

²⁵ *Galatians* 1:16. Chilton, *Rabbi Paul*, pp. 50-53, gives a sensitive interpretation of Paul’s experience of “God’s Son being uncovered within him.”

²⁶ *Analects* 2:4.

²⁷ *Confucius: Words of Wisdom*

Master, and helping later followers to put together his legacy. Of particular interest is the lengthy discussion in this novel about what “the mandate of heaven” meant to Confucius: “He did not think that just because it was a task given by Heaven, Heaven would necessarily afford its protection. One never knew when unexpected obstacles might arise or when one might expire while on a journey. The mandate of Heaven is carried out by a miniscule human being living with the providence of vast Nature. One should not be surprised if unexpected obstacles should arise at unexpected times, but one must not therefore spare any efforts at all in carrying out one’s mission given from Heaven. It is only through the gradual accumulation of such small efforts by human beings that a happy and peaceful age will be realized. I believe these were the Master’s thoughts.”²⁸

And what about the disciples who were to succeed him and carry his message forward. His favorite, Yan Hui, beloved for his simplicity, poverty and devotion, died young at the age of 41, calling forth an impassioned lament from Confucius: “Heaven has bereft me.”²⁹ Zi Lu, a more argumentative and controversial disciple, was depicted as a courageous activist, who had to be reprimanded from time to time for being too bold and impetuous. True to character, he died as a martyr a year before Confucius, trying to promote the Master’s ideas in the kingdom of Wei. A third disciple, Zi Gong, was seen as always sitting on the sidelines, yet it was he who had efficiently and faultlessly taken care of everything that needed to be done during the travels. And he was one of those who survived the Master and carried forward his teachings. He is depicted in Inoue’s novel as “a marvelous expounder of Confucius’ words, one who had completely lost his ego.”³⁰ Thus the judgment offered in Inoue’s book that, of the three, he was the disciple most beloved by the Master.

Core Messages

What are the core messages of these two great teachers and their missions? Are they as different as they appear to be - one focusing on sharing a direct encounter with

²⁸ Inoue, *Confucius*, pp. 109-110.

²⁹ *Analects* 11:8

³⁰ Inoue, *Confucius*, p. 143.

the Divine, as revealed in the historical person of Christ, the other insisting that “until we know how to serve human beings, how can we serve spirits?”³¹

What are some of the threads that might be seen to tie them together? Love is at the heart of both messages, also peace with social justice - something very difficult to attain in times of war and conquest. There is also a shared sense of social responsibility and of the value of each person’s contribution - no matter how small or how overshadowed by implacable forces of nature or egregious abuses of political power. Both had a strong commitment to learning and the accumulation of knowledge. Many commentators on Paul’s writing suggest how he incorporated ideas from Stoic philosophy as well as Jewish law and history into his texts and arguments, while Confucius built his understanding of how humanity could flourish on the basis of the social order and rituals passed down in the classical texts of the early Zhou.

I have obviously opened up a very large subject in this tentative and exploratory comparison of two great teachers and thinkers whose heritage has shaped the civilizations that I have tried to bridge in my educational work. One of the concerns that arose from the fundamentalist Christianity of my early years was how the emphasis on distinctions - both within different Christian traditions and between Christianity and other religions - led to a conflict I felt in my guts on many occasions. For this reason I am deeply thankful that my life pathway brought me into longstanding contact with a faith tradition that has no explicit theology, yet acknowledges the working of Heaven in human lives and embraces many of the same values as Christianity.

I am also deeply thankful for mentors from both traditions who have enriched and guided my life and brought me to this point. On the Western side, I was blessed by Christian teachers, such as Grace Irwin, who combined a passionate faith commitment with outstanding intellectual and literary achievements, also by Christian women close to me who had not been privileged to benefit from higher education yet shared with me a profound wisdom that arose from the spiritual discipline of their lives. In addition there were academic scholars and mentors - both women and men - in England, France, Canada and the United States, who gave generously of their time, modeled the highest standards of scholarship and supported me through the struggle to achieve goals I had

³¹ *Analects 11:12*

embraced at the time of China's opening up in the later 1970s. These include Brian Holmes, my doctoral supervisor, Cicely Watson, my postdoctoral advisor, Marianne Bastid-Bruguière, Hans Weiler, Philip Altbach and many many others. I have tried to pay tribute to them in the memoir I published in 2004.³² It took a little longer for me to put together a tribute to the mentors who enriched my life on the Chinese side, the scholars who have been profiled in *Portraits of Influential Chinese Educators*, published in 2006. Although not all of them had close personal connections, I have found myself constantly challenged and encouraged by their life stories, since working on that book. I often reflect on the ways in which they handled the traumas of external invasion and internal political strife as their scholarly careers unfolded in the turbulent conditions of China's 20th century. This truly modeled for me a kind of "Confucian word made flesh," as I noted in the final chapter of that volume.³³

So what are some of the important and common values of these two faith traditions? The first for me is the importance of humility. This is evident in Paul's life, in spite of his strong personality and apparent love of contention. It can also be seen in his depiction of the kenotic Christ, "who, though he was in the form of God, did not regard equality with God as something to be exploited, but emptied himself, taking the form of a slave, being born in human likeness."³⁴ It is also very clear in the life of Confucius, and of his favorite disciple, Zi Gong, whom Inoue describes as "never projecting his ego in the questions he directed at the Master."³⁵ Japanese theologian, Masao Takanaka, has used the Asian symbol of bamboo to reflect on Christianity and Asian religions, and one of his books ends with a meditation on the spiritual significance of the emptiness of the bamboo stem, set against its extremely strong roots.³⁶

A profound understanding of one's own emptiness and indebtedness to grace can thus be seen as a value that bridges the Christian West and the Confucian East. Paul's image of the care and mentorship he owed to the Christians he had brought to birth – of his life being poured out as a "libation" – provides a vivid depiction of this self-emptying.

³² Hayhoe, *Full Circle: A Life with Hong Kong and China*.

³³ Hayhoe, *Portraits of Influential Chinese Educators*, p. 371.

³⁴ *Philippians* 2:6-7.

³⁵ Inoue, *Confucius*, p. 142.

³⁶ Masao Takenaka, *When the Bamboo Bends: Christ and Culture in Japan* (Geneva: World Council of Churches Publications, 2002), pp. 58-61.

And my sense is that as one becomes older and enters into the final stage of life, the greatest gift we can give is the gift of ourselves, including gifts of time lavished upon those whom we can encourage, guide and support. Then we can celebrate, in turn, the ways in which their scholarship and service rises above and beyond our own.

The second important value is the necessity of social responsibility. With the scientific revolution, European scholarship adopted the idea of “knowledge for its own sake” and service to society was for a time, and not without reason, pushed to a secondary level of importance in the mission of the university.³⁷ This idea would certainly have been foreign both to St Paul and Confucius. Both evinced a tremendous sense of their obligation to apply the knowledge they had been given for the human and social good. Inoue expresses this well for Confucius in the following quote from his purported disciple: “The charisma I sensed about the Master lay in his love for humanity, in his passion for uprightness and in his will – more like tenacity of purpose – to reduce the number of unhappy people, even if only by one”..... He went on to depict his mission as “the cultivation of people who would strive diligently to create a society in which those who were born into this world would be glad that they had been born.”³⁸

Crossan and Reed describe Paul’s passion for social justice during a time of great oppression in the following way: “The parousia of the Lord was not about destruction of earth and relocation to heaven, but about a world in which violence and injustice are transformed into purity and holiness. And, of course,....a transformed world would demand not just spiritual souls, but renewed bodies.”³⁹ And further on, in a discussion of Christian love, “Loving as a fair and equitable sharing of a world that belongs to a just God is what gives content to Paul’s assertion to the Galatians that ‘a new creation is everything’.”⁴⁰ The call for a scholarship that is socially responsible, and indeed seeks to be socially transformative, is thus common to both traditions. It gives all of us cause for reflection on smaller and larger issues in our teaching and scholarship.

³⁷ Bruce Wilshire, *The Moral Collapse of the University: Professionalism, Purity and Alienation* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990); Mark Schwehn, *Exiles from Eden: Religion and the Academic Life in America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993). These two volumes give vivid expression to how this is played out in American higher education.

³⁸ Inoue, *Confucius*, p.99.

³⁹ Crossan and Reed, *In Search of Paul*, p. 170.

⁴⁰ Ibid. p. 175. *Galatians* 6:15.

Finally, let me close with some reflection on Confucius' statement that at seventy, "I could have whatever my heart desired without overstepping the mark."⁴¹ In spite of the disappointments, in spite of the "bitter trail of tears," the failure to find rulers who would listen, the continuing disorder of his world, there was a sense of unity with Heaven, such that his personal wishes and desires were entirely in accord with those of Heaven. This was not an easy complacency or a comfortable sense of goals achieved, but it was an awareness of heart, mind and life having come into connection with Heaven, such that his personal desires never "overstepped the mark." Paul's simple statement, "I have kept the faith,"⁴² expresses a similar sense of quiet assurance in his last days that he had reached a place where his personal wishes and his Heavenly calling had come together – there was no more striving.⁴³

⁴¹ *Analects* 2:4.

⁴² *2 Timothy* 4:7

⁴³ Special thanks are due to the Reverend Canon William (Chip) Stokes, Rector of St Paul's Episcopal Church in Delray Beach, Florida, who led me to the two books on St. Paul which proved so helpful to this comparative reflection. I am deeply grateful to Chip for his spiritual leadership of a congregation where the mind is stretched even as the spirit and heart are nurtured and challenged!

Bibliography

Ames, Roger T., and Rosemont, Henry, *The Analects of Confucius: A Philosophical Translation* (A New Translation Based on the Dingzhou Fragments and Other Recent Archaeological Finds) (New York: Ballantine Books, 1998),

Chiltern, Bruce, *Rabbi Paul: An Intellectual Biography* (New York: Image Books, Doubleday, 2004).

Confucius: Words of Wisdom, A & E Biography, DVD.

Crossan, John Dominic and Reed, Jonathan L , *In Search of Paul: How Jesus's Apostle Opposed Rome's Empire with God's Kingdom*, (New York: Harper Collins, 2004).

Hayhoe, Ruth, *Full Circle: A Life with Hong Kong and China* (Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, University of Hong Kong, 2004).

Hayhoe, Ruth , *Portraits of Influential Chinese Educators* (Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, University of Hong Kong and Springer, 2006).

Inoue, Yasushi, *Confucius: An Historical Novel by a major Japanese writer* (London: Peter Owen, 1989).

The New Oxford Annotated Bible, 3rd edition, 2001.

Qu Chunli, *The Life of Confucius* (Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1996).

Schwehn, Mark , *Exiles from Eden: Religion and the Academic Life in America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993).

Takenaka, Masao, *When the Bamboo Bends: Christ and Culture in Japan* (Geneva: World Council of Churches Publications, 2002).

Wilshire, Bruce, *The Moral Collapse of the University: Professionalism, Purity and Alienation* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990).