

Appendix A: Stimuli

Note: each of the first 8 questions has 4 versions, matched for word count, which were varied between subjects; questions 9-16 were the same for all participants. The variants of the first 8 questions are always as follows: (A) ordinary true belief; (B) Skeptical Pressure; (C) Gettier case; (D) false belief.

1A. Albert is in a furniture store with his wife. He is looking at a bright red table in a display. He believes the table is just the shade of red he was looking for. All of the furniture displays in the showroom have been set up by a professional interior decorator who has a real flair for design and an eye for detail. The showroom features a very creative mix of contemporary and modern pieces, with clear, natural lighting throughout the entire store, and plenty of space around each piece on display. Albert usually likes traditional furniture designs, however the modern design of this particular table appeals to him for some reason. He checks the dimensions and price of the table, and starts to consider buying it. Albert asks his wife, "Do you like this red table?"

1B. Albert is in a furniture store with his wife. He is looking at a bright red table in a display. The displays in the showroom have been set up by a decorator who has a real flair for design. The showroom features a mix of contemporary and modern pieces. Albert likes the way this table looks, and starts to think about buying it. He believes the table is just the shade of red he was looking for. However, a white table under red lighting would look *exactly* the same to him, and Albert has not checked whether the lighting in this store is currently normal, or whether there might be a red spotlight shining on this particular table. There is in fact normal lighting throughout the showroom. Albert asks his wife, "Do you like this red table?"

1C. Albert is in a furniture store with his wife. He is looking at a bright red table in a display. He believes the table is just the shade of red he was looking for. However, a white table under red lighting would look *exactly* the same to him, and Albert has not checked whether the lighting in this store is currently normal. In fact, this showroom was set up by a very creative lighting consultant who has put different brightly-coloured spotlights over almost all the furniture on display. Most things in the store are lit so that they appear to be different colours, but not the one table Albert is now looking at. The coloured spotlights are set up so that shoppers don't notice them at first. Albert asks his wife, "Do you like this red table?"

1D. Albert is in a furniture store with his wife. What he is looking at seems to be a bright red table, but is in fact a white table with a red spotlight shining on it. He believes the table is just the shade of red he was looking for. This furniture showroom was set up by a very creative lighting consultant who has put different brightly-colored spotlights over almost all the furniture on display, including the white table that Albert is looking at. These colored spotlights are set up so that shoppers don't notice them at first, and Albert himself did not notice that the lighting was unusual. Albert likes the way this table looks. He checks the dimensions and price, and starts to consider buying it. Albert asks his wife, "Do you like this red table?"

Q: Does Albert know whether or not the table is red?

2A. Emma is shopping for jewelry. She goes into a nice-looking store, and spends some time looking at various different displays. She tells the salesperson that she is looking for a simple diamond necklace with a classic design. She always likes to try things on before she makes up her mind about them, and she asks the salesperson to show her quite a wide variety of different items, which he brings out for her one tray at a time. Emma selects a diamond necklace from a tray marked "Diamond Earrings and Pendants". "What a lovely diamond!" she says as she tries it on.

2B. Emma is shopping for jewelry. She goes into a nice-looking store, and spends some time looking at several different displays. She tells the salesperson that she is looking for a diamond necklace with a classic design. She always likes to try things on before she makes up her mind about them, and the salesperson shows her several options. Emma selects a diamond pendant from a tray marked "Diamond Earrings and

Pendants". "What a lovely diamond!" she says as she tries it on. Emma could not tell the difference between a real diamond and a cubic zirconium fake just by looking or touching.

2C. Emma is shopping for jewelry. She goes into a nice-looking store, and selects a diamond necklace from a tray marked "Diamond Earrings and Pendants". "What a lovely diamond!" she says as she tries it on. Emma could not tell the difference between a real diamond and a cubic zirconium fake just by looking or touching. In fact, this particular store has a very dishonest employee who has been stealing real diamonds and replacing them with fakes; in the tray Emma chose almost all of the pendants had cubic zirconium stones rather than diamonds (but the one she chose happened to be real).

2D. Emma is shopping for jewelry. She goes into a nice-looking store. She looks at several displays, then selects a necklace from a tray marked "Diamond Earrings and Pendants". "What a lovely diamond!" she says as she tries it on. Emma could not tell the difference between a real diamond and a cubic zirconium fake just by looking or touching. In fact, this particular store has a dishonest employee who has been stealing real diamonds and replacing them with fakes; in the tray Emma chose from, all of the necklaces – including the one she tried on – had cubic zirconium stones rather than diamonds.

Q. Does Emma know whether or not the stone is a diamond?

3A. Amanda has just arrived at Atlantic University as a spring term transfer student. She is looking forward to the change of attending a different institution for a semester, although she knows she will be missing her friends. Today she has to run a number of errands, including stopping in at the bookstore to get several textbooks and a new battery for her laptop computer. After she gets what she needs at the bookstore, Amanda realizes she also needs to get a library card. It's a long walk from the bookstore down to the library, but it is a nice day, and Amanda doesn't mind the walk. When she gets to the library, Amanda goes to the front information desk to ask where to get a card. There is no one staffing the desk just then, so she asks a passing student instead. The student tells her that campus ID cards, which also work as library cards, are issued at a booth on the ground floor of the student activity centre. This is in fact true. Amanda thanks the student and heads over to the student activity centre.

3B. Amanda has just arrived at Atlantic University as a spring term transfer student. She is looking forward to the change of attending a different institution for a semester, although she knows she will be missing her friends. Today she has to run some errands, including buying a new battery for her laptop computer. After that, Amanda realizes she also needs to get a library card. It's a long walk from the computer store down to the library, but it is a nice day, and Amanda doesn't mind the walk. When she gets to the library, Amanda goes to the front information desk to ask where to get a card. There is no one staffing the desk just then, so she asks a passing student instead. The student tells her that campus ID cards, which also work as library cards, are issued at a booth on the ground floor of the student activity centre. This is in fact true, although Amanda has no special information on whether this student is trustworthy or well-informed. In any event, Amanda thanks the student and heads over to the student activity centre.

3C. Amanda has just arrived at Atlantic University as a spring term transfer student. She needs to get a library card, and goes to the information desk at the library to ask where to get a card. There is no one staffing the desk just then, so she asks a passing student instead. The student tells her that campus ID cards, which also work as library cards, are issued at a booth on the ground floor of the student activity centre. Amanda thanks the student and heads over to the student activity centre. As it turns out, this student is confused – he got his ID card at a booth at that location during Orientation Week last fall, but that booth was taken down at the end of that week. At other times in the year students are supposed to get their ID cards from an office on the second floor of the library. However it just so happens the computer network in the library is down today, and so just for today the ID card staff have set up their temporary booth over in the student activity centre.

3D. Amanda has just arrived at Atlantic University as a spring term transfer student. She looking forward to the change of attending a different institution, although she also misses her friends. Today she has to run a few errands, including buying a new battery for her laptop computer. She also needs to get a library card, and goes to the front information desk of the library to ask where to get a card. There is no one staffing the desk just then, so she asks a passing student instead. The student tells her that campus ID cards, which also work as library cards, are issued at a booth on the ground floor of the student activity centre. Amanda thanks the student and heads over to the student activity centre. The student is confused – he got his own ID card at a booth at that location during Orientation Week last fall, but the booth was temporary, and hasn't been there since the end of that week. At other times in the year students can only get their ID cards from an office on the second floor of the library.

Q. Does Amanda know whether or not the student activity centre is where she will be able to get an ID card?

4A. Wanda is out for a weekend afternoon walk. She lives in a large new condominium tower downtown, and her suite is fairly small and does not have any windows that open, so she really likes to get out for some fresh air. Passing near the train station, Wanda wonders what time it is. She glances up at the clock on the train station wall and sees that it says 4:15 pm. It is in fact 4:15 pm at that moment.

4B. Wanda is out for a weekend afternoon walk near the train station and wonders what time it is. She glances up at the clock on the train station wall and sees that it says 4:15 pm. It is in fact 4:15 pm at that moment. The station clock is in fact working, but it has no second hand, and Wanda only looks at it for a moment, so she would not be able to tell if the clock were stopped.

4C. Wanda is out for a weekend afternoon walk. As she passes near the train station, she wonders what time it is. She glances up at the clock on the train station wall and sees that it says 4:15 pm. What she doesn't realize is that this clock is broken and has been showing 4:15 pm for the last two days. But by sheer coincidence, it is in fact 4:15 pm just at the moment when she glances at the clock.

4D. Wanda is out for a weekend afternoon walk. She lives in a small condo downtown, but enjoys the outdoors. As she passes near the train station, she wonders what time it is. She glances up at the clock on the train station wall and sees that it says 4:15 pm. It is in fact 4:53 pm at that moment. What she doesn't realize is that this clock is broken and has been showing 4:15 pm for the last two days.

Q. At the end of the story, does Wanda know whether or not it is 4:15 pm?

5A. Luke works in an office with two other people, Victor and Monica. Their work gets boring sometimes – all three of them are in the accounting department of a large office supply chain – but the salary and benefits are good, and they get along fairly well, chatting at the water cooler when work is slow. All winter Victor has been telling Luke about his plans to go to Las Vegas on his vacation, even showing him the website of the hotel where he has reservations. When Victor is away on vacation, Luke sees Victor's Facebook photos of himself with Vegas landmarks in the background, together with status updates about how much he is enjoying his trip. Victor really did have a good time in Vegas, and was sad to go back home to Markham. When he gets back to work, Victor talks a lot to Luke about how much fun he had on vacation.

5B. Luke works in an office with two other people, Victor and Monica. They all get along fairly well, chatting at the water cooler when work is slow. All winter Victor has been telling Luke about his plans to go to Las Vegas on his vacation, even showing Luke the website of the hotel where he has reservations. When Victor is away on vacation, Luke sees Victor's Facebook photos of himself with Vegas landmarks in the background, together with status updates about how much he is enjoying his trip. Victor really did have a good time in Vegas, and was sad to go back home to Markham. When he gets back to work, Victor talks a lot to Luke about how much

fun he had on vacation. The resolution on the Facebook photos was low, however; Luke could not tell the difference between real vacation pictures from Las Vegas and fakes created with Photoshop.

5C. Luke works in an office with two other people, Victor and Monica. All winter Victor has been describing his plans to go to Las Vegas on his vacation, even showing Luke the website of the hotel where he has reservations. When Victor is away on vacation, Luke sees Victor's Facebook photos of himself with Vegas landmarks in the background, together with status updates about how much he is enjoying his trip. When he gets back to work, Victor talks a lot to Luke about how much fun he had vacationing in Las Vegas. However, Victor didn't really go on the trip; he has just been pretending. His tickets and reservations were cancelled because his credit card was maxed out, and he secretly stayed home in Markham, very skillfully faking the Facebook pictures using Photoshop. Meanwhile, Monica just spent a weekend vacationing in Las Vegas, but kept this a secret from all her co-workers.

5D. Luke works in an office with two other people, Victor and Monica. They get along pretty well. All winter long Victor has been talking about his plans to go to Las Vegas on his vacation, even showing Luke the website of the hotel where he has reservations. When Victor is away on vacation, Luke sees Victor's Facebook photos of himself with Vegas landmarks in the background, together with status updates about how much he is enjoying his trip. When he gets back to work Victor talks a lot to Luke about how much fun he had vacationing in Vegas. However, Victor didn't really go on the trip; he has just been pretending. His tickets and reservations were cancelled because his credit card was maxed out, and he secretly stayed home in Markham, very skillfully faking the Facebook pictures using Photoshop. Incidentally, Monica never takes vacations, and all her co-workers know this about her.

Q. Does Luke know whether or not one of his co-workers recently vacationed in Las Vegas?

6A. Sarah is out with some friends, shopping for clothing at a large mall. She and her friends spend quite a bit of time hanging out at the mall, trying things on and asking each other for advice. They all care about style and have similar taste in clothing and shoes. Sarah likes to try on designer clothes, but rarely buys anything expensive unless it is on sale. As she is standing at the entrance of her favorite store, Sarah sees someone being chased by several security guards. "Oh my God!" she exclaims. "I recognize him. It's Walter, this guy I worked with as a lifeguard last summer." The guards catch up and put Walter into handcuffs right in front of Sarah and her friends.

6B. Sarah is out with some friends, shopping for clothing at a large mall. She and her friends spend quite a bit of time hanging out at the mall trying things on and discussing fashion. As Sarah is standing at the entrance of her favorite store, she sees someone being chased by several security guards. "Oh my God!" she exclaims. "I recognize him. It's Walter, this guy I worked with as a lifeguard last summer." The guards catch up and put Walter into handcuffs right in front of Sarah and her friends. Sarah got a good look at Walter there, but would not have been able to tell him apart from his twin brother, if he had a twin brother (he doesn't actually have one).

6C. Sarah is out with some friends, shopping for clothing at a large mall. As she is standing at the entrance of her favorite store, Sarah sees someone being chased by several security guards. "Oh my God!" she exclaims. "I recognize him. It's Walter, this guy I worked with as a lifeguard last summer." The guards catch up and put their suspect into handcuffs right in front of Sarah and her friends. In fact the person Sarah sees getting caught is not Walter but his twin brother Tom. Sarah didn't know that Walter had a twin. As it happens, Walter was also involved in the robbery, but ran the other way, and has been caught by security guards at the other end of the mall.

6D. Sarah is out with some friends, shopping for clothing at a large mall. She and her friends spend quite a bit of time hanging out at the mall, trying things on and asking each other for advice. As she is standing at the entrance of her favorite store, Sarah sees someone being chased by several security guards. "Oh my God!" she exclaims. "I recognize him. It's Walter, this guy I worked with as a lifeguard last summer." The guards catch up and put their suspect into handcuffs right in front of Sarah and her friends. In fact the person Sarah sees getting caught is not Walter but his twin brother Tom. Sarah didn't know that Walter had a twin. Meanwhile, Walter is at home.

Q. At the end of the story, does Sarah know whether or not Walter just got caught by security guards?

7A. Paul Jones was worried because it was 10 pm and his wife Mary was not home from work yet. Usually she is home by 6 pm. He tried her cell phone but it seemed not to be working. He wasn't sure whether the battery was dead or whether she might have switched it off. Anyway his call went straight through to her voicemail, and he left her several messages. Starting to worry that something might have happened to her, he decided to call local hospitals to ask whether any patient by the name of "Mary Jones" had been admitted that evening. The switchboard operator of the county hospital confirmed that someone by that name had been admitted with major but not life-threatening injuries following a car crash. Paul's wife was in fact awaiting surgery in the county hospital at that moment. Paul grabbed his coat and rushed out to the county hospital.

7B. Paul Jones was worried because it was 10 pm and his wife Mary was not home from work yet. Usually she is home by 6 pm. He tried her cell phone but he just kept getting her voicemail. Starting to worry that something might have happened to her, he decided to call around to local hospitals to ask whether any patient by the name of "Mary Jones" had been admitted that evening. The switchboard operator of the county hospital confirmed that someone by that name had been admitted with major but not life-threatening injuries following a car crash. Paul's wife was in fact awaiting surgery in the hospital at that moment. Paul did not stop to wonder how reliable the switchboard operator would be, or whether she might be referring to another person with the same name as his wife. He just grabbed his coat and rushed out to the county hospital.

7C. Paul Jones was worried because it was 10 pm and his wife Mary was not home from work yet. Usually she is home by 6 pm. He tried her cell phone but just kept getting her voicemail. Starting to worry that something might have happened to her, he decided to call some local hospitals to ask whether any patient by the name of "Mary Jones" had been admitted that evening. The switchboard operator of the county hospital confirmed that someone by that name had been admitted with major but not life-threatening injuries following a car crash. Paul grabbed his coat and rushed out to the county hospital. As it turned out, the patient at the county hospital was not Paul's wife but another woman with the same name. In fact, Paul's wife had a heart attack as she was leaving work, and was at that moment receiving treatment in another hospital downtown.

7D. Paul Jones was worried because it was 10 pm and his wife Mary was not home from work yet. Usually she is home by 6 pm. He tried her cell phone but kept getting her voicemail, like the phone was switched off. Starting to worry that something might have happened to her, he decided to call local hospitals to ask whether any patient by the name of "Mary Jones" had been admitted that evening. The switchboard operator of the county hospital confirmed that someone by that name had been admitted with major but not life-threatening injuries following a car crash. Paul grabbed his coat and rushed out to the county hospital. As it turned out, the patient at the county hospital was not Paul's wife but another woman with the same name. In fact, Paul's wife had been kidnapped and was locked in a trailer home on the far side of town.

Q. Does Paul know whether or not his wife is in hospital?

8A. Brad is driving up to his cousin's cottage north of the city with some friends of his. It is late Friday afternoon, and it's sunny and clear out, the first long weekend of the summer. Brad and his friends have really been looking forward to this time together at the lake, relaxing and enjoying some outdoor fun. It's more than a two-hour drive to get there, but at least it is a scenic route. At one bend in the road Brad points at something on the side of the road. "Hey, look – it's a baby deer!" Everyone in the car sees what Brad does, and agrees that there's a very cute baby deer standing very still in the fenced field by the side of the road. The deer doesn't move as they watch it. They slow down to take a good look, and then keep on driving.

8B. Brad is driving up to his cousin's cottage north of the city with some friends of his. It is late Friday afternoon, and it's sunny and clear out. Brad and his friends are even enjoying the long drive. At one bend in the road Brad points at something on the side of the road. "Hey, look – it's a baby deer!" Everyone in the car sees what Brad does, and agrees that there's a very cute baby deer standing very still in the fenced field by the side of the road. The deer doesn't move as they watch it. At this distance they would not have been able to tell if it had been just a realistic statue rather than a real deer, but it is in fact a real deer, just as they thought. They slow down to take a good look, and then keep on driving.

8C. Brad is driving up to his cousin's cottage north of the city with some friends of his. It is late Friday afternoon, and it's sunny and clear out. At one bend in the road Brad points at something on the side of the road. "Hey, look – it's a baby deer!" Everyone in the car sees what Brad does, and agrees that there's a very cute baby deer standing very still in the fenced field by the side of the road. Actually what they were looking at wasn't a deer at all but a very realistic statue put up for decoration by the property owner. They slow down to take a good look, and then keep on driving. By chance there was also a real deer in the field by the road, but they didn't see it – it was hidden just out of their sight behind some trees.

8D. Brad is driving up to his cousin's cottage north of the city with some friends of his. It is late Friday afternoon, and it's sunny and clear out, and a long weekend. It's more than a two-hour drive to get there, but at least Brad takes a scenic route. At one bend in the road Brad points at something on the side of the road. "Hey, look – it's a baby deer!" Everyone in the car sees what Brad does, and agrees that there's a very cute baby deer standing very still in the fenced field by the side of the road. Actually what they were looking at wasn't a deer at all but a very realistic statue put up for decoration by the property owner. There are no deer in the area just now. They slow down to take a good look, and then keep on driving.

Q. Does Brad know whether or not there is a deer in the field by the road?

9. Bob has a friend, Jill, who has driven a Buick for many years. Bob therefore thinks that Jill drives an American car. He is not aware, however, that her Buick has recently been stolen, and he is also not aware that Jill has replaced it with a Pontiac, which is a different kind of American car.

Q. Does Bob know whether or not Jill currently has an American car?

10. Reginald is on his way to meet some friends at Western Mall, but also needs to mail a parcel. He is wondering whether there is a postal outlet in the mall, or whether he should make a separate stop at the post office on the way. He runs into his good friend Max, who has worked at Western Mall as a security guard for the past four years. Reginald asks Max about mail services at Western Mall, and Max tells him (correctly) that there is a postal outlet next to the food court in the mall. Max is a reliable guy, and Reginald trusts him.

Q. Does Reginald know whether or not there is a postal outlet in the mall?

11. Jessica has heard that her boyfriend Justin has been seen with another woman. Recently he has been staying out late a lot, and has become very secretive about his phone calls and text messages. Jessica confronts him one night, and Justin tells her that he has been completely faithful to her. This is a lie – Justin is in fact having an affair – but Jessica desperately wants to stay together with Justin, and fully believes what he tells her.

Q. At the end of the story, does Jessica know whether or not Justin is faithful to her?

12. Everyone who works at the South Wing cafeteria has been wondering what is causing that bad smell in the back stock room. Lisa goes into the stock room one morning to get a new canister of mayonnaise, and as she takes it from a lower shelf, she finds a large dead rat on the shelf. She gets a close look at the body and recognizes immediately that it is a rat.

Q. At the end of the story, does Lisa know whether or not there is a dead rat in the stock room?

13. Principal Winters is wondering out who vandalized the teacher's lounge over the weekend. Rather than reviewing the videotapes from the security cameras, he calls three of his least favorite students down to his office and asks them about the incident. Two of the students loudly deny having done it; one other student – Jack Whitmore – mumbles quietly that he didn't do it. Principal Winters decides that Jack must be the vandal, forgetting that Jack is in general a very shy and quiet teen. Jack is in fact innocent.

Q. Does Principal Winters know whether or not Jack Whitmore vandalized the teachers' lounge?

14. Detective Green is investigating a murder. Watching the surveillance tapes of the parking garage below the apartment building where the murder took place, he realizes that the killer drove away from the scene at 11:30 pm in a red BMW. Physical evidence in the apartment has conclusively established that there are only two possible suspects in the case: the victim's wife and his older son. His wife arrived in town on a flight from Paris at 11:45 pm, and could not have made it to the scene until well after midnight. The victim's older son drives a red BMW. Detective Green concludes that the murder was committed by the victim's older son.

Q. Does Detective Green know whether or not the victim's older son committed the murder?

15. Prem and Anurag have been co-workers at the university library for the past six months, and once a week work the same shift at the main circulation desk. They chat about work and current events but don't know each other very well. For example, Prem doesn't know that Anurag has an identical twin brother, Samir. One night, Samir went to a major league hockey game, a game that Prem was watching on TV. When the camera panned over the crowd, Prem saw Samir and thought to himself, "Wow, Anurag is at the game tonight." Anurag was actually at home that night, also watching the game on TV.

Q. Did Prem know whether or not Anurag was at the hockey game?

16. Mike is a serious basketball fan, and was looking forward to seeing his middle-ranked home team play the current league champions. Right before the game he said to a friend, "This visiting team would usually beat us, but it's my birthday today, and that's gotta be good luck. Our guys are going to win."

Q. Does Mike know whether or not the home team will win?